NBER Conference on Artificial Intelligence September 17 - Summary

Presenter: Benedikt Dengler

European University Institute

November 2017

Overview

- many papers are quite high-level, few concrete papers and models
- papers range from applying AI to very abstract discussions (Singularity)
- Relatedly, range from very short run to very long run implications
- Now: just quickly mention basic content of papers in turn to get an idea
- ► Background: find all papers, slides and videos on this website

Cockburn et al. - Al and innovation

- ► Al will impact quality of goods/services plus production efficiency
- ▶ but maybe biggest impact: Al as a 'new method of invention'
 - reshaping nature of scientific process and organization of R&D
- ▶ history of Al in research
 - application driven by other fields (robotics) vs GPT candidates vs 'method for invention' (deep learning?)
- preliminary evidence: uptick in importance of 'application research'
- ► implications for organizational process and policy response
 - hypothesis testing on 'hand-created' datasets for specific purpose vs exploitation of 'big data' already existing
 - former: test single, specific hypothesis
 - latter: data abundance allows testing of more complex interdependencies
 - regulation of data access?

Bryolfson et al. - Al and Productivity Paradox

- ► for increasing number of tasks, AI outclass human beings
- ► Puzzle: Al with high hopes but little shows in statistics
 - productivity and output growth rates are declining/low
- explanations: false hopes/mismeasurement/concentration of rewards/implementation lags
- ► favor last point: Al as GPT with implementation lag/slump
- comparison to electrification: productivity advances with similar lag
- diffusion is challenging, goes well beyond ICT capital to organizational change etc.
- ▶ growth accounting with intangible capital necessary
 - GPT requires general investment unobserved in investment data
 - management practices/organization/training etc.

Milgrom, Tadelis - Al and market design

- ► applied paper
- how to use machine learning to make more complex auction designs feasible
- application: US broadband spectrum auctions
- ► 2nd topic: using ML in online sales measuring consumer satisfaction

Athey - Al impact on Economics

- how to translate traditional econometric toolkit to new methods?
 - causality, VI, etc.
 - what about structural models?
- ► From ML: model validation, selection etc.
- ► Essentially lit. review on current state of the art in economics re above topics

Agrawal et al. - Prediction vs Judgement

- ▶ predictions of states vs judgement of state consistent rewards
- study how the two interact in decision problems
- ► application to Al:
 - focus on prediction only
 - how is the tradeoff above impacted by AI advances?

Tucker - Al and Privacy

- privacy in transactions: primarly consumer willingness to pay impact of AI?
- ► algorithmic bias racial or other
- fundamental issue: Data Generating Process (input to AI) is of human source

issue: transmit existing (or historical) biases to AI decisions

Goldfarb, Trefler - Al and Trade

- ► increasing returns to scale warrant strategic trade policy
- ► IRS clearly the case in IT/AI
- national vs international returns to scale
 - data, knowledge diffusion
- ▶ data protection issues
 - large datasets competitive advantage
 - in view of the above: int'l race to the bottom in privacy laws
- ► many current trade policy issues related to data
 - privacy, localization, property rights, access to gov data, Al regulation, source code protection

Camerer - Al and Behavioral Economics

► ML has role in 'mining'/discovering new forms of behavioral biases

► human decision biases sometimes resemble 'ML gone wrong'

- overconfidence/overfitting
- sparsity

Sachs - Al and income inequality

some facts on evolution of labor share in the economy/labor share by sector/labor share by educ/educ attainment/importance of R&D, IP/...

basic framework of structural change

very basic and incomplete

Aghion, Jones, Jones - Al and Economic Growth

- ► AI in goods and ideas creation
- ► implications for growth rate/labor share/IO?
- consequences of singularity?
- ► main two impacts:
 - continued automation
 - baumol's cost disease

Mokyr - Technology and Labor

- ▶ punch line: we've seen this before
- potentially different: speed of adjustment
- works under the assumption of perfect substitutability (cf. Caselli and Manning)
- ► If singularity: managing the transition will be key
 - Al like oil windfall: Norway vs Nigeria

Shapiro, Varian - ML, market structure, competition

- ▶ What are the competitive effects of AI?
- ▶ key bottleneck in ML: (training) data
- data as a 'essential facility' in competition law
- ► Al and IO
 - Returns to scale and first mover advantage
 - ML and vertical integration?
 - potential structure of the 'ML-Industry'?
- ▶ downstream effects:
 - ML/Al changes minimum efficient scale
 - new forms of price discrimination
 - product differentiation
 - algorithmic collusion

Korinek, Stiglitz - AI, labor replacing TC and income distribution

- ► What happens if labor replacing technology arrives?
- ► 1st best: everybody is perfectly insured everybody wins!
- ▶ problem: people are not perfectly insured against TC
- ▶ role for redistribution: mimic missing insurance markets
- why are these markets missing in first place?
 - inherent information problem: what is the future state space?
 - innovation incentives
- ► if PPF shifts out, potentially redistribution can make everybody better off
- central question to desirability of TC: how costly is redistribution? (from capital to labor owners)
- ► Q: What public policies can ensure pareto improvement of TC?
 - think big: UBI, carbon tax (taxes LR scarce factor!) etc.
- growing sectors are dominated by public regulation (health, educ)

14 / 15

Autor, Salomons - Robocalypse now?

- motivation: looming labor immiseration scenarios
- ▶ Q: is recent labor augmenting TC eroding employment?
- productivity growth -> sales growth or decline?
- cross-industry spillovers vs direct effects?
- stability of productivity-employment connection through time, esp 2000+?
- ▶ Results: TC so far
 - net productivity effect on employment is positive
 - channel: spillovers in lagging sectors (esp services)
 - challenge: employment composition (low vs high skilled)
- ▶ Data: EUKLEMS + WIOD